

ARC Paving's hourly rate is higher than the alternate quote, staff evaluated the proposals based on overall value and total anticipated cost to the City, rather than hourly rate alone. Considerations included past performance, service reliability, efficiency, familiarity with City standards, mobilization practices, travel time, and total annual cost.

In 2025, the City spent approximately \$114,000 on pothole patching and roadway repairs, which included 355 tons of bituminous mix. Staff used this historical data to prepare a comparable cost scenario for 2026.

For comparison purposes, staff assumed 355 tons of bituminous mix, approximately 20 trips to project locations, and 120 hours of crew time actively performing work at the project site.

Under this scenario, FPI's quoted rate of \$715 per crew hour results in \$85,800 for 120 hours of on-site work. While mobilization is included in the quoted hourly rate, FPI charges travel time on a port-to-port basis. Based on an estimated 30 minutes of travel each way, staff anticipates approximately one additional billable hour per trip, resulting in an estimated 20 additional hours of crew time, or \$14,300. This results in a total estimated crew cost of \$100,100.

Bituminous mix under **FPI's** proposal would be billed at \$80 per ton. At 355 tons, this results in a material cost of \$28,400. The total estimated cost for FPI, including crew time and materials, is approximately **\$128,500**.

ARC Paving's quoted rate of \$825 per crew hour results in \$99,000 for the same 120 hours of on-site work. ARC Paving is a local contractor and does not charge travel time to and from the project location, resulting in no additional billable hours beyond time spent performing work.

ARC Paving purchases bituminous mix at market price from the same regional supplier used by most paving contractors in the area. Based on 2025 data, ARC's average mix cost was approximately \$81 per ton. At 355 tons, this results in a material cost of \$28,755.

The total estimated cost for **ARC Paving**, including crew time and materials, is approximately **\$127,755**, which is slightly lower than the comparable FPI estimate.

ARC Paving typically operates with a four-person crew. For this type of patching and pothole repair work, crew size is less critical than efficiency and experience. ARC has consistently demonstrated reliable performance and familiarity with City standards and roadway conditions.

The services quoted by both contractors are intended for small-area patching and pothole repair and do not include the use of paving machines. Larger-area patching or full-width paving is not included in this agreement and would be bid separately if needed.

Based on total cost comparison, historical performance, and operational considerations, staff believes ARC Paving provides the best overall value to the City for 2026 roadway patching and pothole repair services.